

**To:** Charmley, William[[charmley.william@epa.gov](mailto:charmley.william@epa.gov)]  
**From:** Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov  
**Sent:** Fri 11/13/2015 7:10:14 PM  
**Subject:** Re: EPA concerns with draft FAA paper on CO2 cost-benefit analysis

Hi Bill. Sorry. I am in Montreal at a meeting on GMBM. Understand your concerns - and I am sure we can work them. I would suggest "Australian" drafting and deleting items of concern. We do need to provide a paper - as it was provided to SG - not doing so would raise eye brows. But content can be refined. Can we talk Monday? Cheers. Lourdes

Sent from my iPad

On Nov 13, 2015, at 2:07 PM, Charmley, William <[charmley.william@epa.gov](mailto:charmley.william@epa.gov)> wrote:

Dear Lourdes,

I hope all is going well for you in Montreal.

Mike brought me up to speed in the last few days regarding the current dialog between our teams on the FAA sponsored work at MIT on cost-benefit assessment of the CO2 stringency options.

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

I wanted to explain to you that these issues are being elevated within EPA in offices other than my (Chris's) office. If you have time for a short call this afternoon or evening I would appreciate it – you can call me on my cell phone (Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy)

Thanks

Bill

Bill Charmley

Director

Assessment and Standards Division

Office of Transportation and Air Quality

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

National Vehicle and Fuel Emissions Laboratory

2000 Traverwood Drive

Ann Arbor, MI 48105

desk ph. 734-214-4466

**Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**

e-mail: [charmley.william@epa.gov](mailto:charmley.william@epa.gov)

**To:** Samulski, Michael[samulski.michael@epa.gov]; Manning, Bryan[manning.bryan@epa.gov]; Davidson, Ken[Davidson.Ken@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Hengst, Benjamin[Hengst.Benjamin@epa.gov]; Kathryn Sargeant (sargeant.kathryn@epa.gov)[sargeant.kathryn@epa.gov]; Audette, Lucie[audette.lucie@epa.gov]; Sutton, Tia[sutton.tia@epa.gov]; Hoyer, Marion[hoyer.marion@epa.gov]  
**From:** Charmley, William  
**Sent:** Fri 2/12/2016 6:02:01 PM  
**Subject:** Meeting with OIRA, FAA, and others regarding analytical approaches for quantifying costs and benefits from aircraft CO2 standards

Dear Mike, Bryan and Ken,

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

This meeting has been set up for Thursday, Feb 18 from 11 am – 12:30pm at OIRA in D.C.

# **Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**

# **Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**

**Mike, Bryan, Ken - I apologize for the late notice on this – but I would like all 3 of you to participate in this call, and I think that maybe Ben is going to go. Please respond to everyone on this email chain so we know if you all can cover this, and then I will leave it to Mike to manage the process.**

Thanks

Bill

# **Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

**From:** [Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov](mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov) [mailto:[Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov](mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov)]

**Sent:** Friday, January 29, 2016 5:43 PM

**To:** [Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy]

[Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov](mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov); Samulski, Michael; Manning, Bryan; McCabe, Janet;

[Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy]

[Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy]

Hengst, Benjamin; Charmley, William; LeFranc, Maurice;  
[Rich.Swayze@faa.gov](mailto:Rich.Swayze@faa.gov); [carl.burleson@faa.gov](mailto:carl.burleson@faa.gov); [shoshana.lew@dot.gov](mailto:shoshana.lew@dot.gov); Atkinson, Emily;

[Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy]

**Cc:** [Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy] [Arthur.Rypinski@dot.gov](mailto:Arthur.Rypinski@dot.gov);

[Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy]

[Laszlo.Windhoffer@faa.gov](mailto:Laszlo.Windhoffer@faa.gov);  
[maryalice.locke@faa.gov](mailto:maryalice.locke@faa.gov); [curtis.holsclaw@faa.gov](mailto:curtis.holsclaw@faa.gov)

**Subject:** Int'l Aircraft CO2 Emissions Standard to US Domestic Regulation

Dear All,

First, please pass this invitation to those I missed.

This email follows-up on the action item and discussions from the EOP telecon on Tuesday, 1/26 at 530pm. There will be a joint OIRA/EPA/FAA meeting at the OIRA offices located at **1800 G Street, NW, 9<sup>th</sup> floor** on **Thursday, February 18** from **11am to 12:30pm**.

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Please do not hesitate to contact Chad Whiteman  
myself with questions.

**Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy** or

Best Regards,

**Ralph Iovinelli**

Manager, Emissions Division (AEE-300)

Office of Environment and Energy

Federal Aviation Administration

800 Independence Ave., SW

Washington, DC 20591

+1-202-267-3566 office

+1-202-288-6372 mobile

[ralph.iovinelli@faa.gov](mailto:ralph.iovinelli@faa.gov)





**Cc:** Hengst, Benjamin[Hengst.Benjamin@epa.gov]; Samulski, Michael[samulski.michael@epa.gov]; Manning, Bryan[manning.bryan@epa.gov]  
**To:** Audette, Lucie[audette.lucie@epa.gov]; Birgfeld, Erin[Birgfeld.Erin@epa.gov]; Leggett, Cullen[Leggett.Cullen@epa.gov]  
**From:** Charmley, William  
**Sent:** Mon 2/8/2016 1:53:21 PM  
**Subject:** Fwd: Updated Fact Sheet - Clean and tracked  
[ICAO CO2 Standard Q and A\\_2-8-16 850am.docx](#)  
[ATT00001.htm](#)

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** "Welsh, Kevin" <[REDACTED]> **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**  
**Date:** February 8, 2016 at 8:49:57 AM EST  
**To:** "Vahlsing, Candace" <[REDACTED]> **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**  
"Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov" <Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov>, "manning.bryan@epa.gov" <manning.bryan@epa.gov>, "charmley.william@epa.gov" <charmley.william@epa.gov>, "Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov" <Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov>, "samulski.michael@epa.gov" <samulski.michael@epa.gov>, "bonnefoy\_philippe@bah.com" <bonnefoy\_philippe@bah.com>  
**Subject: RE: Updated Fact Sheet - Clean and tracked**

Updates to Q&A Document

-----Original Message-----

**From:** Welsh, Kevin  
**Sent:** Monday, February 08, 2016 8:06 AM  
**To:** Vahlsing, Candace <[REDACTED]> **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**; Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov; manning.bryan@epa.gov; charmley.william@epa.gov; Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov; samulski.michael@epa.gov; bonnefoy\_philippe@bah.com  
**Subject:** RE: Updated Fact Sheet - Clean and tracked

Attachments!

-----Original Message-----

**From:** Welsh, Kevin  
**Sent:** Monday, February 08, 2016 8:05 AM  
**To:** Vahlsing, Candace <[REDACTED]> **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**; Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov; manning.bryan@epa.gov; charmley.william@epa.gov; Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov; samulski.michael@epa.gov; bonnefoy\_philippe@bah.com  
**Subject:** Updated Fact Sheet - Clean and tracked

All,

Here is an updated version of the fact sheet before we talk in a bit.

Kevin

-----Original Message-----

From: Vahlsing, Candace

Sent: Monday, February 08, 2016 12:24 AM

To: [Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov](mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov); [manning.bryan@epa.gov](mailto:manning.bryan@epa.gov); [charmley.william@epa.gov](mailto:charmley.william@epa.gov);

Welsh, Kevin **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy** [Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov](mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov);

[samulski.michael@epa.gov](mailto:samulski.michael@epa.gov); [bonnefoy\\_philippe@bah.com](mailto:bonnefoy_philippe@bah.com)

Subject: RE: For your input

Please use these versions instead.

-----Original Message-----

From: Vahlsing, Candace M. EOP/WHO

Sent: Monday, February 8, 2016 12:15 AM

To: 'Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov' <[Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov](mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov)>; [manning.bryan@epa.gov](mailto:manning.bryan@epa.gov);

[charmley.william@epa.gov](mailto:charmley.william@epa.gov); Welsh, Kevin W. EOP/NSC

**Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**; [Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov](mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov); [samulski.michael@epa.gov](mailto:samulski.michael@epa.gov);

[bonnefoy\\_philippe@bah.com](mailto:bonnefoy_philippe@bah.com)

Subject: RE: For your input

Updated version here. Talk to you in the morning.

Also attached the start of a Q and A, mostly done by EPA.

Let's focus on the fact sheet first.

-----Original Message-----

From: [Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov](mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov) [[mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov](mailto:mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov)]

Sent: Sunday, February 7, 2016 10:31 PM

To: Vahlsing, Candace M. EOP/WHO <**Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**>;

[manning.bryan@epa.gov](mailto:manning.bryan@epa.gov); [charmley.william@epa.gov](mailto:charmley.william@epa.gov); Welsh, Kevin W. EOP/NSC

<**Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**>; [Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov](mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov); [samulski.michael@epa.gov](mailto:samulski.michael@epa.gov);

[bonnefoy\\_philippe@bah.com](mailto:bonnefoy_philippe@bah.com)

Subject: RE: For your input

Attached are a few edits for your consideration...

-----Original Message-----

From: Vahlsing, Candace M. EOP/WHO [Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy]  
Sent: Sunday, February 07, 2016 8:19 PM  
To: Manning, Bryan; Charmley, William; Welsh, Kevin W. EOP/NSC; Iovinelli, Ralph (FAA); Maurice, Lourdes (FAA); Samulski, Michael; [bonnefoy\\_philippe@bah.com](mailto:bonnefoy_philippe@bah.com)  
Subject: Re: For your input

Thank you!

Original Message  
From: Manning, Bryan  
Sent: Sunday, February 7, 2016 8:09 PM  
To: Vahlsing, Candace M. EOP/WHO; Charmley, William; Welsh, Kevin W. EOP/NSC; [Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov](mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov); [Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov](mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov); Samulski, Michael; [bonnefoy\\_philippe@bah.com](mailto:bonnefoy_philippe@bah.com)  
Subject: RE: For your input

Hello Candace,

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Thank you,

Bryan

Bryan Manning  
U.S. EPA Office of Transportation and Air Quality Large Marine and Aviation Center  
2000 Traverwood Drive  
Ann Arbor, MI 48105  
(ph) 734-214-4832 (fax) 734-214-4816  
[manning.bryan@epa.gov](mailto:manning.bryan@epa.gov)

-----Original Message-----

From: Vahlsing, Candace M. EOP/WHO [Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy]  
Sent: Sunday, February 07, 2016 6:52 PM  
To: Charmley, William <[charmley.william@epa.gov](mailto:charmley.william@epa.gov)>; Welsh, Kevin W. EOP/NSC  
[Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy]; [Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov](mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov); [Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov](mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov);  
Samulski, Michael <[samulski.michael@epa.gov](mailto:samulski.michael@epa.gov)>; Manning, Bryan  
<[manning.bryan@epa.gov](mailto:manning.bryan@epa.gov)>; [bonnefoy\\_philippe@bah.com](mailto:bonnefoy_philippe@bah.com)  
Subject: Re: For your input

Thanks for the input.

## **Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**

From: Charmley, William

Sent: Sunday, February 7, 2016 5:46 PM

To: Welsh, Kevin W. EOP/NSC; Vahlsing, Candace M. EOP/WHO;

[Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov](mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov); [Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov](mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov); Samulski, Michael; Manning, Bryan;  
[bonnefoy\\_philippe@bah.com](mailto:bonnefoy_philippe@bah.com)

Subject: RE: For your input

Kevin and Candice,

## **Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**

# **Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**

Overall I am good with the updated draft.

Thanks

Bill

-----Original Message-----

From: Welsh, Kevin [REDACTED] **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**

Sent: Sunday, February 07, 2016 2:49 PM

To: Vahlsing, Candace; [Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov](mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov); [Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov](mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov); Samulski, Michael; Charmley, William; Manning, Bryan; [bonnefoy\\_philippe@bah.com](mailto:bonnefoy_philippe@bah.com)

Subject: RE: For your input

All, here is an updated version of the fact sheet. I would appreciate any input from the EPA team as soon as possible, and I will work with Ralph, Philippe and Mike to round out the facts and data points. Candace, you also mentioned a Q&A. Happy to start working that.

-----Original Message-----

From: Vahlsing, Candace

Sent: Friday, February 05, 2016 10:18 PM

To: [Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov](mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov)<<mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov>>;  
[Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov](mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov)<<mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov>>;  
[samulski.michael@epa.gov](mailto:samulski.michael@epa.gov)<<mailto:samulski.michael@epa.gov>>;  
[charmley.william@epa.gov](mailto:charmley.william@epa.gov)<<mailto:charmley.william@epa.gov>>;  
[Manning.Bryan@epamail.epa.gov](mailto:Manning.Bryan@epamail.epa.gov)<<mailto:Manning.Bryan@epamail.epa.gov>>

Cc: Welsh, Kevin

◀ **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy** ▶

Subject: For your input

Hi Team,

**Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**

Great job this week!!

**To:** Cook, Leila[cook.leila@epa.gov]  
**From:** Charmley, William  
**Sent:** Mon 2/8/2016 11:04:48 AM  
**Subject:** Fwd: For your input  
[ICAO GHG Standard+KW+BC+RI CV.docx](#)  
[ATT00001.htm](#)  
[ICAO GHG Standard v2.docx](#)  
[ATT00002.htm](#)  
[ICAO CO2 Standard Q and A.DOCX](#)  
[ATT00003.htm](#)

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** "Charmley, William" <charmley.william@epa.gov>  
**Date:** February 8, 2016 at 6:02:31 AM EST  
**To:** "Audette, Lucie" <audette.lucie@epa.gov>, "Birgfeld, Erin" <Birgfeld.Erin@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** "Manning, Bryan" <manning.bryan@epa.gov>, "Leggett, Cullen" <Leggett.Cullen@epa.gov>, "Samulski, Michael" <samulski.michael@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Fwd: For your input

This is the last update to the communication material I see from Sunday evening.

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** "Vahlsing, Candace M. EOP/WHO" <Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy>  
**Date:** February 8, 2016 at 12:23:39 AM EST  
**To:** "Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov" <Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov>, "manning.bryan@epa.gov" <manning.bryan@epa.gov>, "charmley.william@epa.gov" <charmley.william@epa.gov>, "Welsh, Kevin W. EOP/NSC" <Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy>, "Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov" <Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov>, "samulski.michael@epa.gov" <samulski.michael@epa.gov>, "bonnefoy\_philippe@bah.com" <bonnefoy\_philippe@bah.com>  
**Subject:** RE: For your input

**Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**



-----Original Message-----

From: Vahlsing, Candace M. EOP/WHO

Sent: Monday, February 8, 2016 12:15 AM

To: 'Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov' <Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov>; manning.bryan@epa.gov; charmley.william@epa.gov; Welsh, Kevin W. EOP/NSC

**Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**; Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov; samulski.michael@epa.gov; bonnefoy\_philippe@bah.com

Subject: RE: For your input

Updated version here. Talk to you in the morning.

Also attached the start of a Q and A, mostly done by EPA.

Let's focus on the fact sheet first.

-----Original Message-----

From: [Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov](mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov) [<mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov>]

Sent: Sunday, February 7, 2016 10:31 PM

To: Vahlsing, Candace M. EOP/WHO **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy** manning.bryan@epa.gov; charmley.william@epa.gov; Welsh, Kevin W. EOP/NSC

<**Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**>; Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov; samulski.michael@epa.gov; bonnefoy\_philippe@bah.com

Subject: RE: For your input

Attached are a few edits for your consideration...

-----Original Message-----

From: Vahlsing, Candace M. EOP/WHO

[<mailto:> **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**]

Sent: Sunday, February 07, 2016 8:19 PM

To: Manning, Bryan; Charmley, William; Welsh, Kevin W. EOP/NSC; Iovinelli, Ralph (FAA); Maurice, Lourdes (FAA); Samulski, Michael;

[bonnefoy\\_philippe@bah.com](mailto:bonnefoy_philippe@bah.com)

Subject: Re: For your input

Thank you!

Original Message

From: Manning, Bryan

Sent: Sunday, February 7, 2016 8:09 PM

To: Vahlsing, Candace M. EOP/WHO; Charmley, William; Welsh, Kevin W. EOP/NSC; [Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov](mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov); [Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov](mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov); Samulski, Michael;

[bonnefoy\\_philippe@bah.com](mailto:bonnefoy_philippe@bah.com)  
Subject: RE: For your input

Hello Candace,

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Thank you,

Bryan

Bryan Manning  
U.S. EPA Office of Transportation and Air Quality Large Marine and Aviation Center  
2000 Traverwood Drive  
Ann Arbor, MI 48105  
(ph) 734-214-4832 (fax) 734-214-4816  
[manning.bryan@epa.gov](mailto:manning.bryan@epa.gov)

-----Original Message-----

From: Vahlsing, Candace M. EOP/WHO

[mailto:**Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**]

Sent: Sunday, February 07, 2016 6:52 PM

To: Charmley, William <[charmley.william@epa.gov](mailto:charmley.william@epa.gov)>; Welsh, Kevin W. EOP/NSC

**Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy** [Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov](mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov);

[Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov](mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov); Samulski, Michael <[samulski.michael@epa.gov](mailto:samulski.michael@epa.gov)>;

Manning, Bryan <[manning.bryan@epa.gov](mailto:manning.bryan@epa.gov)>; [bonnefoy\\_philippe@bah.com](mailto:bonnefoy_philippe@bah.com)

Subject: Re: For your input

Thanks for the input.

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

From: Charmley, William  
Sent: Sunday, February 7, 2016 5:46 PM  
To: Welsh, Kevin W. EOP/NSC; Vahlsing, Candace M. EOP/WHO;  
[Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov](mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov); [Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov](mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov); Samulski, Michael; Manning,  
Bryan; [bonnefoy\\_philippe@bah.com](mailto:bonnefoy_philippe@bah.com)  
Subject: RE: For your input

Kevin and Candice,

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

# **Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**

Overall I am good with the updated draft.

Thanks

Bill

-----Original Message-----

From: Welsh, Kevin [i] **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**

Sent: Sunday, February 07, 2016 2:49 PM

To: Vahlsing, Candace; [Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov](mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov); [Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov](mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov); Samulski, Michael; Charmley, William; Manning, Bryan; [bonnefoyc\\_philippe@bah.com](mailto:bonnefoyc_philippe@bah.com)

Subject: RE: For your input

All, here is an updated version of the fact sheet. I would appreciate any input from the EPA team as soon as possible, and I will work with Ralph, Philippe and Mike to round out the facts and data points. Candace, you also mentioned a Q&A. Happy to start working that.

-----Original Message-----

From: Vahlsing, Candace

Sent: Friday, February 05, 2016 10:18 PM

To: [Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov](mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov)<<mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov>>; [Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov](mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov)<<mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov>>; [samulski.michael@epa.gov](mailto:samulski.michael@epa.gov)<<mailto:samulski.michael@epa.gov>>; [charmley.william@epa.gov](mailto:charmley.william@epa.gov)<<mailto:charmley.william@epa.gov>>; [Manning.Bryan@epamail.epa.gov](mailto:Manning.Bryan@epamail.epa.gov)<<mailto:Manning.Bryan@epamail.epa.gov>>

Cc: Welsh, Kevin

**Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**

Subject: For your input

Hi Team,

## **Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**

We'll also need to develop a Q and A.

Great job this week!!

**To:** Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov[Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov]  
**From:** Charmley, William  
**Sent:** Fri 11/13/2015 7:06:46 PM  
**Subject:** EPA concerns with draft FAA paper on CO2 cost-benefit analysis

Dear Lourdes,

I hope all is going well for you in Montreal.

Mike brought me up to speed in the last few days regarding the current dialog between our teams on the FAA sponsored work at MIT on cost-benefit assessment of the CO2 stringency options.

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

I wanted to explain to you that these issues are being elevated within EPA in offices other than my (Chris's) office. If you have time for a short call this afternoon or evening I would appreciate it – you can call me on my cell phone (Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy).

Thanks

Bill

Bill Charmley

Director

Assessment and Standards Division

Office of Transportation and Air Quality

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

National Vehicle and Fuel Emissions Laboratory

2000 Traverwood Drive

Ann Arbor, MI 48105

desk ph. 734-214-4466

**cell ph.** Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

e-mail: [charmley.william@epa.gov](mailto:charmley.william@epa.gov)



**To:** Audette, Lucie[audette.lucie@epa.gov]; Manning, Bryan[manning.bryan@epa.gov]; Samulski, Michael[samulski.michael@epa.gov]  
**From:** Charmley, William  
**Sent:** Wed 11/4/2015 2:49:17 PM  
**Subject:** FW: ICAO CO2 Standard Meeting - Agenda and NEW TIME  
CAEP 10 WP XX US CO2 Stringency EPA-FAA- final 2 November 2015.docx

Mike, Bryan and Lucie –

Didn't realize until this morning that you all had not been included in this email.

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Bill

**From:** Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov [mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov]  
**Sent:** Monday, November 02, 2015 5:05 PM  
**To:** [REDACTED] McCabe, Janet; Hengst, Benjamin; Charmley, William; LeFranc, Maurice; Rich.Swayze@faa.gov; carl.burleson@faa.gov; shoshana.lew@dot.gov; Atkinson, Emily; brandon.belford@dot.gov  
**Cc:** [REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]  
**Subject:** RE: ICAO CO2 Standard Meeting - Agenda and NEW TIME

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

**From:** Vahlsing, Candace  
**Sent:** Friday, October 23, 2015 4:18 PM  
**To:** Maurice, Lourdes (FAA); [McCabe.Janet@epa.gov](mailto:McCabe.Janet@epa.gov); [Hengst.Benjamin@epa.gov](mailto:Hengst.Benjamin@epa.gov); [charmley.william@epa.gov](mailto:charmley.william@epa.gov); [lefranc.maurice@epa.gov](mailto:lefranc.maurice@epa.gov); Swayze, Rich (FAA); Burleson, Carl (FAA); Lew, Shoshana (OST); [Atkinson.Emily@epa.gov](mailto:Atkinson.Emily@epa.gov); Belford, Brandon (OST)  
**Cc:** Welsh, Kevin; Utech, Dan G.; Bodnar, Paul; Duke, Rick; Zaidi, Ali; Mohtadi, Shara  
**Subject:** RE: ICAO CO2 Standard Meeting - Agenda and NEW TIME

Thank you!

**From:** [Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov](mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov) [<mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov>]  
**Sent:** Friday, October 23, 2015 1:37 PM  
**To:** Vahlsing, Candace; [McCabe.Janet@epa.gov](mailto:McCabe.Janet@epa.gov); [Hengst.Benjamin@epa.gov](mailto:Hengst.Benjamin@epa.gov); [charmley.william@epa.gov](mailto:charmley.william@epa.gov); [lefranc.maurice@epa.gov](mailto:lefranc.maurice@epa.gov); [Rich.Swayze@faa.gov](mailto:Rich.Swayze@faa.gov); [carl.burleson@faa.gov](mailto:carl.burleson@faa.gov); [shoshana.lew@dot.gov](mailto:shoshana.lew@dot.gov); [Atkinson.Emily@epa.gov](mailto:Atkinson.Emily@epa.gov); [brandon.belford@dot.gov](mailto:brandon.belford@dot.gov)  
**Cc:** Welsh, Kevin; Utech, Dan G.; Bodnar, Paul; Duke, Rick; Zaidi, Ali; Mohtadi, Shara  
**Subject:** RE: ICAO CO2 Standard Meeting - Agenda and NEW TIME

Dear Kevin and Candace

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Cheers Lourdes

**From:** Vahlsing, Candace

## Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

**Sent:** Sunday, October 18, 2015 10:00 PM

**To:** 'McCabe, Janet'; 'Hengst, Benjamin'; 'charmley.william@epa.gov'; 'lefranc.maurice@epa.gov'; Swayze, Rich (FAA); Burleson, Carl (FAA); Maurice, Lourdes (FAA); Lew, Shoshana (OST); 'Atkinson, Emily'; Belford, Brandon (OST)

**Cc:** Welsh, Kevin; Utech, Dan G.; Bodnar, Paul; Duke, Rick; Zaidi, Ali; Mohtadi, Shara

**Subject:** RE: ICAO CO2 Standard Meeting - Agenda and NEW TIME

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Please let us know if you have any questions.

Many thanks!

Kevin and Candace

## **IPC ON Aircraft CO2 Standard**

DATE: October 15, 2015

LOCATION: EEOB 208

TIME: 6:00-7:00pm

# **Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**

# **Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

**From:** Welsh, Kevin

**Sent:** Wednesday, October 14, 2015 6:21 PM

**To:** 'McCabe, Janet'; 'Hengst, Benjamin'; 'charmley.william@epa.gov';  
'lefranc.maurice@epa.gov'; 'Rich.Swayze@faa.gov'; 'carl.burleson@faa.gov';  
'Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov'; 'shoshana.lew@dot.gov'; 'Atkinson, Emily';  
'brandon.belford@dot.gov'

**Cc:** Utech, Dan G.; Bodnar, Paul; Duke, Rick; Vahlsing, Candace

**Subject:** RE: ICAO CO2 Standard Meeting - Agenda and NEW TIME

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Look forward to seeing you tomorrow.

Thanks,

Kevin

**From:** Welsh, Kevin

**Sent:** Tuesday, October 13, 2015 7:56 PM

**To:** 'McCabe, Janet' <[McCabe.Janet@epa.gov](mailto:McCabe.Janet@epa.gov)>; 'Hengst, Benjamin' <[Hengst.Benjamin@epa.gov](mailto:Hengst.Benjamin@epa.gov)>; 'charmley.william@epa.gov' <[charmley.william@epa.gov](mailto:charmley.william@epa.gov)>; 'lefranc.maurice@epa.gov' <[lefranc.maurice@epa.gov](mailto:lefranc.maurice@epa.gov)>; 'Rich.Swayze@faa.gov' <[Rich.Swayze@faa.gov](mailto:Rich.Swayze@faa.gov)>; 'carl.burleson@faa.gov' <[carl.burleson@faa.gov](mailto:carl.burleson@faa.gov)>; 'Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov' <[Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov](mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov)>; 'shoshana.lew@dot.gov' <[shoshana.lew@dot.gov](mailto:shoshana.lew@dot.gov)>; 'Atkinson, Emily' <[Atkinson.Emily@epa.gov](mailto:Atkinson.Emily@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Utech, Dan G. <**Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**>; Bodnar, Paul <**Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**>

Duke, Rick <**Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**>; Vahlsing, Candace

<**Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**>

**Subject:** ICAO CO2 Standard Meeting - Agenda and NEW TIME

All,

Attached is the agenda for Thursday's aircraft CO2 discussion. Also please note that due to a conflict that has arisen here, WE WILL START AT 6PM (we will still plan to stop at 7pm).

Thanks,

Kevin

**From:** Welsh, Kevin

**Sent:** Friday, October 09, 2015 12:03 PM

**To:** 'McCabe, Janet' <McCabe.Janet@epa.gov>; 'Hengst, Benjamin' <Hengst.Benjamin@epa.gov>; 'charmley.william@epa.gov' <charmley.william@epa.gov>; 'lefranc.maurice@epa.gov' <lefranc.maurice@epa.gov>; 'Rich.Swayze@faa.gov' <Rich.Swayze@faa.gov>; 'carl.burleson@faa.gov' <carl.burleson@faa.gov>; 'Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov' <Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov>; 'shoshana.lew@dot.gov' <shoshana.lew@dot.gov>; 'Atkinson, Emily' <Atkinson.Emily@epa.gov>

**Cc:** Utech, Dan G. <Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy>; Bodnar, Paul <Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy>; Duke, Rick <Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy>; Vahlsing, Candace <Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy>

**Subject:** RE: NEW TIME: RE: ICAO CO2 Standard Meeting - Please Hold October 15 from 5:30-7pm

All,

Next Thursday's meeting will be in EEOB 208 at 5:30pm. Here is a link to register for the meeting:

**Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Also, since this is a late meeting, we will do our best to start right on time, so please leave enough time for security.

Thanks,

Kevin



**From:** Welsh, Kevin  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 08, 2015 4:09 PM  
**To:** 'McCabe, Janet' <McCabe.Janet@epa.gov>; 'Hengst, Benjamin' <Hengst.Benjamin@epa.gov>; 'charmley.william@epa.gov' <charmley.william@epa.gov>; 'lefranc.maurice@epa.gov' <lefranc.maurice@epa.gov>; 'Rich.Swayze@faa.gov' <Rich.Swayze@faa.gov>; 'carl.burleson@faa.gov' <carl.burleson@faa.gov>; 'Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov' <Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov>; 'shoshana.lew@dot.gov' <shoshana.lew@dot.gov>  
**Cc:** Utech, Dan G. <Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy>; Bodnar, Paul <Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy>; Duke, Rick <Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy>; Vahlsing, Candace <Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy>  
**Subject:** NEW TIME: RE: ICAO CO2 Standard Meeting - Please Hold October 15 from 5:30-7pm

All,

Due to several conflicts, we will now hold this meeting on October 15 from 5:30pm to 7pm. Apologies for the late time, but looks to be about the only time that will work in the next couple of weeks.

Thanks,

Kevin

**From:** Welsh, Kevin  
**Sent:** Monday, October 05, 2015 8:01 PM  
**To:** 'McCabe, Janet' <McCabe.Janet@epa.gov>; 'Hengst, Benjamin' <Hengst.Benjamin@epa.gov>; 'charmley.william@epa.gov' <charmley.william@epa.gov>; 'lefranc.maurice@epa.gov' <lefranc.maurice@epa.gov>; 'Rich.Swayze@faa.gov' <Rich.Swayze@faa.gov>; 'carl.burleson@faa.gov' <carl.burleson@faa.gov>; 'Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov' <Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov>; 'shoshana.lew@dot.gov' <shoshana.lew@dot.gov>  
**Cc:** Utech, Dan G. <Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy>; Bodnar, Paul <Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy>; Duke, Rick <Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy>; Vahlsing, Candace <Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy>  
**Subject:** ICAO CO2 Standard Meeting - Please Hold October 15 from 3:00-4:30pm

All,

# **Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**

Best regards,

Kevin

**To:** Samulski, Michael[samulski.michael@epa.gov]; Manning, Bryan[manning.bryan@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Audette, Lucie[audette.lucie@epa.gov]  
**From:** Charmley, William  
**Sent:** Tue 9/29/2015 3:26:15 PM  
**Subject:** FW: Call on ICAO CO2 Standard this Thursday at 5pm  
FAA-OST Breifing-ICAO CO2 Standard 2015-09-28 final review draft.docx

Bryan and Mike —

Can you do a call no Thursday at 5pm?

I have not yet looked at this document from Lourdes, but it would be good if we can give her some feedback soon. If I sent her a response email, when would be a good deadline we could meet for feedback – sometime on Wednesday?

Thanks

Bill

**From:** Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov [mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, September 29, 2015 9:37 AM  
**To:** Charmley, William  
**Cc:** Samulski, Michael; Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov  
**Subject:** FW: Call on ICAO CO2 Standard this Thursday at 5pm

Hi Bill

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Cheers Lourdes

**From:** Welsh, Kevin [Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, September 29, 2015 9:25 AM  
**To:** Maurice, Lourdes (FAA); 'charmley.william@epa.gov'  
**Cc:** Vahlsing, Candace  
**Subject:** Call on ICAO CO2 Standard this Thursday at 5pm

Dear Lourdes and Bill,

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Thanks,

Kevin

Call-in details to follow.

**To:** Bills gmail (b) (6)  
**From:** Charmley, William  
**Sent:** Wed 7/8/2015 1:54:07 AM  
**Subject:** Fwd: Materials for WH meeting (ICAO CO2 Standard)  
FAA-EPA CO2 Standard briefing 7July2015 clean.docx  
ATT00001.htm

Bill Charmley  
Assessment and Standards Division  
Office of Transportation and Air Quality  
National Vehicle & Fuel Emissions Laboratory  
US Environmental Protection Agency  
Ann Arbor, Michigan  
Desk phone 734-214-4466  
Mobile phone 734-545-0333  
Email [charmley.william@epa.gov](mailto:charmley.william@epa.gov)

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** <[Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov](mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov)>  
**Date:** July 7, 2015 at 6:01:56 PM EDT  
**To:** <[manning.bryan@epa.gov](mailto:manning.bryan@epa.gov)>, <[Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov](mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov)>  
**Cc:** <[charmley.william@epa.gov](mailto:charmley.william@epa.gov)>, <[samulski.michael@epa.gov](mailto:samulski.michael@epa.gov)>, <[audette.lucie@epa.gov](mailto:audette.lucie@epa.gov)>, <[Leggett.Cullen@epa.gov](mailto:Leggett.Cullen@epa.gov)>, <[Yen.David@epa.gov](mailto:Yen.David@epa.gov)>, <[curtis.holsclaw@faa.gov](mailto:curtis.holsclaw@faa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Materials for WH meeting (ICAO CO2 Standard)

Hi Bryan,

Attached is the final review draft. All edits have been made

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Per our discussion, we will have a quick review with Rich when he returns from leave, at the same time you will review with Janet and Chris.

Thanks,

Ralph

**From:** Manning, Bryan [mailto:manning.bryan@epa.gov]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, July 07, 2015 3:01 PM  
**To:** Iovinelli, Ralph (FAA); Maurice, Lourdes (FAA)  
**Cc:** Charmley, William; Samulski, Michael; Audette, Lucie; Leggett, Cullen; Yen, David; Holsclaw, Curtis (FAA)  
**Subject:** RE: Materials for WH meeting (ICAO CO2 Standard)

Thank you for the comments, Ralph. Since Cullen helped develop the figures, I plan to have him join us for the call after 3 pm. If you do not mind, call us at [Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy] code

[Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy] Drop me an email just prior to the call.

Also, attached please see some additional comments.

**Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**

**Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**

Look forward to talking to you soon.

Thanks again,

Bryan

Bryan Manning

U.S. EPA Office of Transportation and Air Quality

Large Marine and Aviation Center

2000 Traverwood Drive

Ann Arbor, MI 48105

(ph) 734-214-4832 (fax) 734-214-4816

[manning.bryan@epa.gov](mailto:manning.bryan@epa.gov)

**From:** [Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov](mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov) [<mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov>]

**Sent:** Tuesday, July 07, 2015 12:06 PM

**To:** Manning, Bryan; [Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov](mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov)

**Cc:** Charmley, William; Samulski, Michael; Audette, Lucie; Leggett, Cullen; Yen, David; [curtis.holsclaw@faa.gov](mailto:curtis.holsclaw@faa.gov)

**Subject:** RE: Materials for WH meeting (ICAO CO2 Standard)

Thanks Bryan,

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Thanks,

Ralph

**From:** Manning, Bryan [<mailto:manning.bryan@epa.gov>]

**Sent:** Monday, July 06, 2015 5:37 PM

**To:** Iovinelli, Ralph (FAA); Maurice, Lourdes (FAA)

**Cc:** Charmley, William; Samulski, Michael; Audette, Lucie; Leggett, Cullen; Yen, David; Holsclaw, Curtis (FAA)

**Subject:** RE: Materials for WH meeting (ICAO CO2 Standard)

Hello Ralph,



I hope you had a good 4<sup>th</sup> of July weekend as well. We appreciate your comments.

## **Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**

# **Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**

Let us know if you have any further comments.

Thank you,

Bryan

Bryan Manning

U.S. EPA Office of Transportation and Air Quality

Large Marine and Aviation Center

2000 Traverwood Drive

Ann Arbor, MI 48105

(ph) 734-214-4832 (fax) 734-214-4816

[manning.bryan@epa.gov](mailto:manning.bryan@epa.gov)

**From:** [Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov](mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov) [mailto:[Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov](mailto:Ralph.Iovinelli@faa.gov)]

**Sent:** Monday, July 06, 2015 12:02 PM

**To:** Manning, Bryan; [Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov](mailto:Lourdes.Maurice@faa.gov)

**Cc:** Charmley, William; Samulski, Michael; Audette, Lucie; Leggett, Cullen; Yen, David; [curtis.holsclaw@faa.gov](mailto:curtis.holsclaw@faa.gov)

**Subject:** RE: Materials for WH meeting (ICAO CO2 Standard)

Hope your holiday break was relaxing, Bryan. Thanks for the draft briefing.

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Thanks,

Ralph

**From:** Manning, Bryan [<mailto:manning.bryan@epa.gov>]

**Sent:** Wednesday, July 01, 2015 4:43 PM

**To:** Iovinelli, Ralph (FAA); Maurice, Lourdes (FAA)

**Cc:** Charmley, William; Samulski, Michael; Audette, Lucie; Leggett, Cullen; Yen, David; Holsclaw, Curtis (FAA)

**Subject:** Materials for WH meeting (ICAO CO2 Standard)

Hello Ralph and Lourdes,

We appreciate the draft briefing you sent us last week for the July 14 meeting at the White House on the ICAO CO2 standard. Attached please find our comments on the draft briefing in clean and redline versions (1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> attachments) of the document. Also, for your convenience, we have attached the original draft briefing you sent us last week (3<sup>rd</sup> attachment).

Note, Lucie Audette and I are out on annual leave tomorrow, and we will be back on Monday (July 6) prepared to work with you on any feedback you may have early next week. Let us know if you have any questions.

Happy 4<sup>th</sup> of July!

Thank you,

Bryan

Bryan Manning

U.S. EPA Office of Transportation and Air Quality

Large Marine and Aviation Center

2000 Traverwood Drive

Ann Arbor, MI 48105

(ph) 734-214-4832 (fax) 734-214-4816

[manning.bryan@epa.gov](mailto:manning.bryan@epa.gov)

**To:** Niebling, William[Niebling.William@epa.gov]; Samulski, Michael[samulski.michael@epa.gov];  
Blubaugh, Jim[Blubaugh.Jim@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Hight, Cate[Hight.Cate@epa.gov]  
**From:** Phillips, Anna  
**Sent:** Thur 5/5/2016 4:49:17 PM  
**Subject:** RE: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

Thanks, William and Mike, for your helpful feedback.

I don't think we need to do more than what is suggested below so I will get back to USEU and keep you all posted.

Best,

Anna

---

***Anna Phillips***

*Program Manager for Europe  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)*

*Office of International & Tribal Affairs*

*Washington, D.C. 20460*

*Tel: (+1) 202.564.6419 Fax: (+1) 202.565.2427  
E-mail: [phillips.anna@epa.gov](mailto:phillips.anna@epa.gov)*

*<http://www2.epa.gov/international-cooperation>*



*Please consider the environment before printing this message.*

**From:** Niebling, William  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 05, 2016 10:24 AM  
**To:** Samulski, Michael <samulski.michael@epa.gov>; Phillips, Anna <Phillips.Anna@epa.gov>; Blubaugh, Jim <Blubaugh.Jim@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Hight, Cate <Hight.Cate@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

Anna, maybe we can chat about the MBMs.

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

**From:** Samulski, Michael  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 05, 2016 10:18 AM  
**To:** Phillips, Anna <Phillips.Anna@epa.gov>; Blubaugh, Jim <Blubaugh.Jim@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Hight, Cate <Hight.Cate@epa.gov>; Niebling, William <Niebling.William@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

Anna,

My group has the lead at EPA for the CO2 standard, but we only tangentially follow the GMBM work. OAP's Cate Hight or William Niebling (copied on this message) may be a better source on GMBM questions.

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Mike

\*\*\*\*\*

Michael Samulski

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Office of Transportation and Air Quality

Director, Large Marine and Aircraft Center

1 (734) 214-4532

[samulski.michael@epa.gov](mailto:samulski.michael@epa.gov)

\*\*\*\*\*

**From:** Phillips, Anna

**Sent:** Wednesday, May 04, 2016 6:29 PM

**To:** Blubaugh, Jim <[Blubaugh.Jim@epa.gov](mailto:Blubaugh.Jim@epa.gov)>; Samulski, Michael  
<[samulski.michael@epa.gov](mailto:samulski.michael@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** FW: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

Jim and Mike -- Per the attached from USEU (which also includes a recent cable and e-mail correspondence with the State Department), please let me know how OTAQ would recommend responding to the issue highlighted below.

Many thanks...  
Anna

---

***Anna Phillips***

*Program Manager for Europe  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)*

*Office of International & Tribal Affairs*

*Washington, D.C. 20460*

*Tel: (+1) 202.564.6419 Fax: (+1) 202.565.2427*

*E-mail: [phillips.anna@epa.gov](mailto:phillips.anna@epa.gov)*

*<http://www2.epa.gov/international-cooperation>*



*Please consider the environment before printing this message.*

**From:** Robinson, Mark T (USEU) [<mailto:RobinsonMT1@state.gov>]

**Sent:** Wednesday, May 04, 2016 9:56 AM

**To:** Phillips, Anna <[Phillips.Anna@epa.gov](mailto:Phillips.Anna@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Tibbetts, Robert E <[TibbettsRE@state.gov](mailto:TibbettsRE@state.gov)>; Thomas, Erica K (USEU) <[ThomasEK@state.gov](mailto:ThomasEK@state.gov)>

**Subject:** FW: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

Anna,

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Thanks,

Mark

SBU

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

**From:** Robinson, Mark T (USEU)

**Sent:** Wednesday, May 04, 2016 9:32 AM

**To:** Carnahan, Kimberly C; Peters-Stanley, Molly R; Stacey, Tricia J (Dept of Transportation)

**Cc:** Dunlap, Ellen M; Tibbetts, Robert E; Thomas, Erica K (USEU); Smaczniak, Kim N

**Subject:** RE: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

Kim,

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process



Thanks,

Mark

SBU

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

**From:** Carnahan, Kimberly C

**Sent:** Wednesday, May 04, 2016 12:10 AM

**To:** Robinson, Mark T (USEU); Peters-Stanley, Molly R; Stacey, Tricia J (Dept of Transportation)

**Cc:** Dunlap, Ellen M; Tibbetts, Robert E; Thomas, Erica K (USEU); Smaczniak, Kim N

**Subject:** RE: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

SBU

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

**From:** Robinson, Mark T (USEU)

**Sent:** Tuesday, May 03, 2016 11:08 AM

**To:** Carnahan, Kimberly C; Peters-Stanley, Molly R; Stacey, Tricia J (Dept of Transportation)  
**Cc:** Dunlap, Ellen M; Tibbetts, Robert E; Thomas, Erica K (USEU); Smaczniak, Kim N  
**Subject:** FW: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

Kim and Molly,

## **Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Thanks,

Mark

SBU

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

**From:** SMART Core

**Sent:** Tuesday, May 03, 2016 4:46 PM

**To:** Robinson, Mark T (USEU)

**Cc:** USEU-SMARTS; ANKARA-SMARTS; BERLIN-SMARTS; BRATISLAVA-SMARTS; BRUSSELS-SMARTS; BUCHAREST-SMARTS; BUDAPEST-SMARTS; Copenhagen-SMARTS; DUBLIN SMARTS; DUSSELDORF-SMARTS; Smart, Frankfurt S; HAMBURG-SMARTS; HELSINKI, SMARTS; ISTANBUL-SMARTS; KRAKOW-SMARTS; LEIPZIG-SMARTS; LISBON-SMARTS; LJUBLJANA-SMARTS; LONDON-SMARTS; LUXEMBOURG, SMARTS; MADRID-SMARTS; MILAN-SMARTS; MUNICH-SMARTS; NAPLES-SMARTS; NICOSIA, SMARTS; PARIS-SMARTS; PRAGUE, SMARTS; Riga, SMARTS; ROME-SMARTS; Sofia-SMARTS; Stockholm, SMARTS; STRASBOURG-SMARTS; Tallinn-SMARTS; TheHague-SMARTS; UNVIE, SMARTS; Valletta, SMARTS; VATICAN-SMARTS; VIENNA, SMARTS; Vilnius-SMARTS; WARSAW-SMARTS; ZAGREB-SMARTS; ATHENS-SMARTS; OECD-SMARTS  
**Subject:** EU: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

**UNCLASSIFIED**  
SBU



---

<b>MRN:</b>	16 USEU BRUSSELS 290
<b>Date/DTG:</b>	May 03, 2016 / 031444Z MAY 16
<b>From:</b>	USEU BRUSSELS
<b>Action:</b>	WASHDC, SECSTATE <i>ROUTINE</i>
<b>E.O.:</b>	13526
<b>TAGS:</b>	SENV, TRGY, EAIR, KGHG, ICAO, EUN, FAA, DOT, 3A
<b>Captions:</b>	SENSITIVE
<b>Reference:</b>	<a href="#"><u>16 USEU BRUSSELS 226</u></a>
<b>Subject:</b>	EU: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

1. (U) Summary: In an amicable April 27 session with the European Parliament's (EP) Environment, Public Health, and Food Safety Committee (ENVI), European Commissioner for Mobility and Transport Violeta Bulc endorsed International Civil Aviation Authority (ICAO) President Aliu's proposal for an offset-based global market-based measure (GMBM) to address the rapidly growing impact of carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) emissions from international aviation, which are approximately two percent of total annual global CO<sub>2</sub> emissions. Party leaders criticized the proposal's level of ambition but generally accepted it, on the condition of further ambition from supplemental systems, including with the United States. End summary.

2. (U) Bulc praised the ICAO proposal for its ambition, global scope, inclusion of periodic review, and use of high-quality offsets, and applauded President Aliu for deflecting less

ambitious proposals from major emerging economies. She rejected Members of the European Parliament's (MEPs) criticism that the ICAO proposal is not ambitious enough, emphasizing that it is the best—and only—tool for taking global action on aviation emissions. Additionally, she highlighted European efforts to curb the aviation sector's fuel consumption—noting EasyJet's February announcement of a concept for hydrogen fuel cell hybrid engines—route optimization, and powering stationary aircraft with auxiliary power units or electrical connections. Bulc also noted her recent fruitful meeting with U.S. Secretary of Transportation Anthony Foxx on April 25 and reported the United States and Europe were on the same side. (Secretary Foxx's meeting with Bulc reported septel.)

3. (U) Party leaders' tones varied consistent with their bloc's established positions, but overall ENVI MEPs are eager to maintain and bolster EU leadership and ambition for greenhouse gas emissions reduction efforts in general. ENVI MEPs are conscious that they enjoy particular influence on aviation emissions because "Stop the Clock"—which suspended the application of the EU Emissions Trading Scheme (ETS) to international flights to and from Europe—expires at the end of 2016 with or without a global agreement. The MEPs widely agreed that EP support for the ICAO GMBM—and permanent non-application of ETS to international flights—will be contingent on proposals from the Commission to supplement action under ICAO with unilateral or bilateral (with the United States) additional ambition.

4. (U) Bulc insisted that the question of whether to continue including intra-Europe aviation in the ETS must wait until after ICAO concludes the GMBM negotiations. She did not directly address rumors that the U.S. EPA plans to set stronger standards for U.S. carriers, on either fuel economy or offset purchases or the MEPs' calls for a bilateral agreement with the United States. In response to MEPs' concerns that exemptions would potentially defang the GMBM, Bulc downplayed their scale, noting exemptions would be limited to the poorest, most-isolated, and generally least-connected countries where the system would be cost-prohibitive to implement.

5. (SBU) Comment: MEPs, especially those in ENVI, view themselves as torchbearers on this issue, and ones holding leverage in Stop the Clock. However, they do not appear eager to engage in another drawn-out fight over applying ETS to international flights. Even the MEPs most critical of the ICAO proposal and most ardently advocating for ambitious action on aviation emissions did not reject the proposal; they sought to protect the EU's ability to enforce additional ambition via ETS, and called for additional actions unilaterally or bilaterally, leaving room for the Commission to pledge supplemental efforts without disrupting the ICAO process.

## **Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)**

**Signature:**

Gardner

---

**Drafted By:**

**Cleared By:**

BRUSSELS:Robinson, Mark T (USEU)  
USEU/ECON:Oosterloo, Hylko J (USEU)  
USEU/FAA:Malo, Gjergj (Dept of Transportation)  
USEU/ECON:Roth, Amy E (USEU)  
USEU/EXEC:McHone, Christopher H (USEU)  
USEU/ECON:Koplovsky, Michael (USEU)  
BRUSSELS:Robinson, Mark T (USEU)  
EU MEMBER STATES COLLECTIVE *ROUTINE*

**Approved By:**

**Released By:**

**Info:**

---

**Dissemination Rule:**

Released Copy

**UNCLASSIFIED**

SBU

**To:** Samulski, Michael[samulski.michael@epa.gov]; Phillips, Anna[Phillips.Anna@epa.gov]; Blubaugh, Jim[Blubaugh.Jim@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Hight, Cate[Hight.Cate@epa.gov]  
**From:** Niebling, William  
**Sent:** Thur 5/5/2016 2:23:31 PM  
**Subject:** RE: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

Anna, maybe we can chat about the MBMs.

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

**From:** Samulski, Michael  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 05, 2016 10:18 AM  
**To:** Phillips, Anna <Phillips.Anna@epa.gov>; Blubaugh, Jim <Blubaugh.Jim@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Hight, Cate <Hight.Cate@epa.gov>; Niebling, William <Niebling.William@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

Anna,

My group has the lead at EPA for the CO2 standard, but we only tangentially follow the GMBM work. OAP's Cate Hight or William Niebling (copied on this message) may be a better source on GMBM questions.

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Mike

\*\*\*\*\*

Michael Samulski

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Office of Transportation and Air Quality

Director, Large Marine and Aircraft Center

1 (734) 214-4532

[samulski.michael@epa.gov](mailto:samulski.michael@epa.gov)

\*\*\*\*\*

**From:** Phillips, Anna

**Sent:** Wednesday, May 04, 2016 6:29 PM

**To:** Blubaugh, Jim <[Blubaugh.Jim@epa.gov](mailto:Blubaugh.Jim@epa.gov)>; Samulski, Michael  
<[samulski.michael@epa.gov](mailto:samulski.michael@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** FW: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

Jim and Mike -- Per the attached from USEU (which also includes a recent cable and e-mail correspondence with the State Department), please let me know how OTAQ would recommend responding to the issue highlighted below.

Many thanks...



Anna

---

***Anna Phillips***

*Program Manager for Europe  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)*

*Office of International & Tribal Affairs*

*Washington, D.C. 20460*

*Tel: (+1) 202.564.6419 Fax: (+1) 202.565.2427*

*E-mail: [phillips.anna@epa.gov](mailto:phillips.anna@epa.gov)*

*<http://www2.epa.gov/international-cooperation>*



*Please consider the environment before printing this message.*

**From:** Robinson, Mark T (USEU) [<mailto:RobinsonMT1@state.gov>]

**Sent:** Wednesday, May 04, 2016 9:56 AM

**To:** Phillips, Anna <[Phillips.Anna@epa.gov](mailto:Phillips.Anna@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Tibbetts, Robert E <[TibbettsRE@state.gov](mailto:TibbettsRE@state.gov)>; Thomas, Erica K (USEU) <[ThomasEK@state.gov](mailto:ThomasEK@state.gov)>

**Subject:** FW: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

Anna,

Hey, how's things going? EP/ENVI MEPs in a hearing with Transportation Commissioner Bulc last week brought up (created?)

**Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Thanks,

Mark

SBU

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

**From:** Robinson, Mark T (USEU)

**Sent:** Wednesday, May 04, 2016 9:32 AM

**To:** Carnahan, Kimberly C; Peters-Stanley, Molly R; Stacey, Tricia J (Dept of Transportation)

**Cc:** Dunlap, Ellen M; Tibbetts, Robert E; Thomas, Erica K (USEU); Smaczniak, Kim N

**Subject:** RE: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

Kim,

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Thanks,

Mark

SBU

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

**From:** Carnahan, Kimberly C  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 04, 2016 12:10 AM  
**To:** Robinson, Mark T (USEU); Peters-Stanley, Molly R; Stacey, Tricia J (Dept of Transportation)  
**Cc:** Dunlap, Ellen M; Tibbetts, Robert E; Thomas, Erica K (USEU); Smaczniak, Kim N  
**Subject:** RE: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

SBU

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

**From:** Robinson, Mark T (USEU)  
**Sent:** Tuesday, May 03, 2016 11:08 AM  
**To:** Carnahan, Kimberly C; Peters-Stanley, Molly R; Stacey, Tricia J (Dept of Transportation)  
**Cc:** Dunlap, Ellen M; Tibbetts, Robert E; Thomas, Erica K (USEU); Smaczniak, Kim N  
**Subject:** FW: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

Kim and Molly,

# **Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Thanks,

Mark

SBU

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

**From:** SMART Core

**Sent:** Tuesday, May 03, 2016 4:46 PM

**To:** Robinson, Mark T (USEU)

**Cc:** USEU-SMARTS; ANKARA-SMARTS; BERLIN-SMARTS; BRATISLAVA-SMARTS; BRUSSELS-SMARTS; BUCHAREST-SMARTS; BUDAPEST-SMARTS; Copenhagen-SMARTS; DUBLIN SMARTS; DUSSELDORF-SMARTS; Smart, Frankfurt S; HAMBURG-SMARTS; HELSINKI, SMARTS; ISTANBUL-

SMARTS; KRAKOW-SMARTS; LEIPZIG-SMARTS; LISBON-SMARTS; LJUBLJANA-SMARTS; LONDON-SMARTS; LUXEMBOURG, SMARTS; MADRID-SMARTS; MILAN-SMARTS; MUNICH-SMARTS; NAPLES-SMARTS; NICOSIA, SMARTS; PARIS-SMARTS; PRAGUE, SMARTS; Riga, SMARTS; ROME-SMARTS; Sofia-SMARTS; Stockholm, SMARTS; STRASBOURG-SMARTS; Tallinn-SMARTS; TheHague-SMARTS; UNVIE, SMARTS; Valletta, SMARTS; VATICAN-SMARTS; VIENNA, SMARTS; Vilnius-SMARTS; WARSAW-SMARTS; ZAGREB-SMARTS; ATHENS-SMARTS; OECD-SMARTS

**Subject:** EU: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

**UNCLASSIFIED**  
**SBU**



---

<b>MRN:</b>	16 USEU BRUSSELS 290
<b>Date/DTG:</b>	May 03, 2016 / 031444Z MAY 16
<b>From:</b>	USEU BRUSSELS
<b>Action:</b>	WASHDC, SECSTATE <i>ROUTINE</i>
<b>E.O.:</b>	13526
<b>TAGS:</b>	SENV, TRGY, EAIR, KGHG, ICAO, EUN, FAA, DOT, 3A
<b>Captions:</b>	SENSITIVE
<b>Reference:</b>	<u>16 USEU BRUSSELS 226</u>
<b>Subject:</b>	EU: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

1. (U) Summary: In an amicable April 27 session with the European Parliament's (EP) Environment, Public Health, and Food Safety Committee (ENVI), European Commissioner for Mobility and Transport Violeta Bulc endorsed International Civil Aviation Authority (ICAO) President Aliu's proposal for an offset-based global market-based measure (GMBM) to address the rapidly growing impact of carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) emissions from international aviation, which are approximately two percent of total annual global CO<sub>2</sub> emissions. Party leaders criticized the proposal's level of ambition but generally accepted it, on the condition of further ambition from supplemental systems, including with the United States. End summary.

2. (U) Bulc praised the ICAO proposal for its ambition, global scope, inclusion of periodic review, and use of high-quality offsets, and applauded President Aliu for deflecting less ambitious proposals from major emerging economies. She rejected Members of the European Parliament's (MEPs) criticism that the ICAO proposal is not ambitious enough, emphasizing that it is the best—and only—tool for taking global action on aviation emissions. Additionally, she

highlighted European efforts to curb the aviation sector's fuel consumption—noting EasyJet's February announcement of a concept for hydrogen fuel cell hybrid engines—route optimization, and powering stationary aircraft with auxiliary power units or electrical connections. Bulc also noted her recent fruitful meeting with U.S. Secretary of Transportation Anthony Foxx on April 25 and reported the United States and Europe were on the same side. (Secretary Foxx's meeting with Bulc reported septel.)

3. (U) Party leaders' tones varied consistent with their bloc's established positions, but overall ENVI MEPs are eager to maintain and bolster EU leadership and ambition for greenhouse gas emissions reduction efforts in general. ENVI MEPs are conscious that they enjoy particular influence on aviation emissions because "Stop the Clock"—which suspended the application of the EU Emissions Trading Scheme (ETS) to international flights to and from Europe—expires at the end of 2016 with or without a global agreement. The MEPs widely agreed that EP support for the ICAO GMBM—and permanent non-application of ETS to international flights—will be contingent on proposals from the Commission to supplement action under ICAO with unilateral or bilateral (with the United States) additional ambition.

4. (U) Bulc insisted that the question of whether to continue including intra-Europe aviation in the ETS must wait until after ICAO concludes the GMBM negotiations. She did not directly address rumors that the U.S. EPA plans to set stronger standards for U.S. carriers, on either fuel economy or offset purchases or the MEPs' calls for a bilateral agreement with the United States. In response to MEPs' concerns that exemptions would potentially defang the GMBM, Bulc downplayed their scale, noting exemptions would be limited to the poorest, most-isolated, and generally least-connected countries where the system would be cost-prohibitive to implement.

5. (SBU) Comment: MEPs, especially those in ENVI, view themselves as torchbearers on this issue, and ones holding leverage in Stop the Clock. However, they do not appear eager to engage in another drawn-out fight over applying ETS to international flights. Even the MEPs most critical of the ICAO proposal and most ardently advocating for ambitious action on aviation emissions did not reject the proposal; they sought to protect the EU's ability to enforce additional ambition via ETS, and called for additional actions unilaterally or bilaterally, leaving room for the Commission to pledge supplemental efforts without disrupting the ICAO process.

### **Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)**

**Signature:**

Gardner

**Drafted By:**  
**Cleared By:**

BRUSSELS:Robinson, Mark T (USEU)  
USEU/ECON:Oosterloo, Hylko J (USEU)  
USEU/FAA:Malo, Gjergj (Dept of Transportation)  
USEU/ECON:Roth, Amy E (USEU)  
USEU/EXEC:McHone, Christopher H (USEU)  
USEU/ECON:Koplovsky, Michael (USEU)  
BRUSSELS:Robinson, Mark T (USEU)  
EU MEMBER STATES COLLECTIVE *ROUTINE*

**Approved By:**  
**Released By:**  
**Info:**

---

**Dissemination Rule:**

Released Copy

**UNCLASSIFIED**  
SBU



**To:** Phillips, Anna[Phillips.Anna@epa.gov]; Blubaugh, Jim[Blubaugh.Jim@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Hight, Cate[Hight.Cate@epa.gov]; Niebling, William[Niebling.William@epa.gov]  
**From:** Samulski, Michael  
**Sent:** Thur 5/5/2016 2:18:28 PM  
**Subject:** RE: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

Anna,

My group has the lead at EPA for the CO2 standard, but we only tangentially follow the GMBM work. OAP's Cate Hight or William Niebling (copied on this message) may be a better source on GMBM questions.

With respect to the question on if we are going to go further than ICAO on the CO2 standard, here is our standard response:

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Mike

\*\*\*\*\*

Michael Samulski

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Office of Transportation and Air Quality

Director, Large Marine and Aircraft Center

1 (734) 214-4532

samulski.michael@epa.gov

\*\*\*\*\*

**From:** Phillips, Anna

**Sent:** Wednesday, May 04, 2016 6:29 PM

**To:** Blubaugh, Jim <Blubaugh.Jim@epa.gov>; Samulski, Michael  
<samulski.michael@epa.gov>

**Subject:** FW: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

Jim and Mike -- Per the attached from USEU (which also includes a recent cable and e-mail correspondence with the State Department), please let me know how OTAQ would recommend responding to the issue highlighted below.

Many thanks...  
Anna

---

***Anna Phillips***

*Program Manager for Europe  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)*

*Office of International & Tribal Affairs*

*Washington, D.C. 20460*

*Tel: (+1) 202.564.6419 Fax: (+1) 202.565.2427  
E-mail: [phillips.anna@epa.gov](mailto:phillips.anna@epa.gov)*

<http://www2.epa.gov/international-cooperation>



*Please consider the environment before printing this message.*

**From:** Robinson, Mark T (USEU) [<mailto:RobinsonMT1@state.gov>]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 04, 2016 9:56 AM  
**To:** Phillips, Anna <[Phillips.Anna@epa.gov](mailto:Phillips.Anna@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Tibbetts, Robert E <[TibbettsRE@state.gov](mailto:TibbettsRE@state.gov)>; Thomas, Erica K (USEU) <[ThomasEK@state.gov](mailto:ThomasEK@state.gov)>  
**Subject:** FW: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

Anna,

Hey, how's things going? EP/ENVI MEPs in a hearing with Transportation Commissioner Bulc last week brought up (created?) a rumor that the EPA is considering establishing either fuel economy or offsets requirements surpassing ICAO's (respectively from earlier this year and the GMBM). This sounds like something that isn't true, but wanted to confirm with you.

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Thanks,

Mark

SBU

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

**From:** Robinson, Mark T (USEU)  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 04, 2016 9:32 AM  
**To:** Carnahan, Kimberly C; Peters-Stanley, Molly R; Stacey, Tricia J (Dept of Transportation)  
**Cc:** Dunlap, Ellen M; Tibbetts, Robert E; Thomas, Erica K (USEU); Smaczniak, Kim N  
**Subject:** RE: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

Kim,

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Thanks,

Mark

SBU

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

**From:** Carnahan, Kimberly C  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 04, 2016 12:10 AM  
**To:** Robinson, Mark T (USEU); Peters-Stanley, Molly R; Stacey, Tricia J (Dept of Transportation)  
**Cc:** Dunlap, Ellen M; Tibbetts, Robert E; Thomas, Erica K (USEU); Smaczniak, Kim N

**Subject:** RE: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

Thanks so much for the readout, Mark.

**Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**

SBU

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

**From:** Robinson, Mark T (USEU)

**Sent:** Tuesday, May 03, 2016 11:08 AM

**To:** Carnahan, Kimberly C; Peters-Stanley, Molly R; Stacey, Tricia J (Dept of Transportation)

**Cc:** Dunlap, Ellen M; Tibbetts, Robert E; Thomas, Erica K (USEU); Smaczniak, Kim N

**Subject:** FW: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

Kim and Molly,

**Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process**

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

We'd welcome any insight you can provide regarding:

1) this rumor of a bilateral “sweetener” – Todd had mentioned to ENVI in one of his visits last year that *if* ICAO did not deliver a viable GMBM proposal, *then* perhaps the U.S. and EU could come to a bilateral arrangement to avoid applying ETS to international flights. Big IF, big THEN. I haven't heard much beyond that from DC or Brussels.

# Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Thanks,

Mark

SBU

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

**From:** SMART Core

**Sent:** Tuesday, May 03, 2016 4:46 PM

**To:** Robinson, Mark T (USEU)

**Cc:** USEU-SMARTS; ANKARA-SMARTS; BERLIN-SMARTS; BRATISLAVA-SMARTS; BRUSSELS-SMARTS; BUCHAREST-SMARTS; BUDAPEST-SMARTS; Copenhagen-SMARTS; DUBLIN SMARTS; DUSSELDORF-SMARTS; Smart, Frankfurt S; HAMBURG-SMARTS; HELSINKI, SMARTS; ISTANBUL-SMARTS; KRAKOW-SMARTS; LEIPZIG-SMARTS; LISBON-SMARTS; LJUBLJANA-SMARTS; LONDON-SMARTS; LUXEMBOURG, SMARTS; MADRID-SMARTS; MILAN-SMARTS; MUNICH-SMARTS; NAPLES-SMARTS; NICOSIA, SMARTS; PARIS-SMARTS; PRAGUE, SMARTS; Riga, SMARTS; ROME-SMARTS; Sofia-SMARTS; Stockholm, SMARTS; STRASBOURG-SMARTS; Tallinn-SMARTS; TheHague-SMARTS; UNVIE, SMARTS; Valletta, SMARTS; VATICAN-SMARTS; VIENNA, SMARTS; Vilnius-SMARTS; WARSAW-SMARTS; ZAGREB-SMARTS; ATHENS-SMARTS; OECD-SMARTS

**Subject:** EU: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal Sales Pitch

**UNCLASSIFIED**

SBU



---

**MRN:**

16 USEU BRUSSELS 290

**Date/DTG:**

May 03, 2016 / 031444Z MAY 16

ED\_001734\_00030681-00007

**From:** USEU BRUSSELS  
**Action:** WASHDC, SECSTATE *ROUTINE*  
**E.O.:** 13526  
**TAGS:** SENV, TRGY, EAIR, KGHG, ICAO, EUN, FAA, DOT, 3A  
**Captions:** SENSITIVE  
**Reference:** 16 USEU BRUSSELS 226  
**Subject:** EU: MEPs Accede to Bulc's ICAO Emissions Proposal  
Sales Pitch

1. (U) Summary: In an amicable April 27 session with the European Parliament's (EP) Environment, Public Health, and Food Safety Committee (ENVI), European Commissioner for Mobility and Transport Violeta Bulc endorsed International Civil Aviation Authority (ICAO) President Aliu's proposal for an offset-based global market-based measure (GMBM) to address the rapidly growing impact of carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) emissions from international aviation, which are approximately two percent of total annual global CO<sub>2</sub> emissions. Party leaders criticized the proposal's level of ambition but generally accepted it, on the condition of further ambition from supplemental systems, including with the United States. End summary.

2. (U) Bulc praised the ICAO proposal for its ambition, global scope, inclusion of periodic review, and use of high-quality offsets, and applauded President Aliu for deflecting less ambitious proposals from major emerging economies. She rejected Members of the European Parliament's (MEPs) criticism that the ICAO proposal is not ambitious enough, emphasizing that it is the best—and only—tool for taking global action on aviation emissions. Additionally, she highlighted European efforts to curb the aviation sector's fuel consumption—noting EasyJet's February announcement of a concept for hydrogen fuel cell hybrid engines—route optimization, and powering stationary aircraft with auxiliary power units or electrical connections. Bulc also noted her recent fruitful meeting with U.S. Secretary of Transportation Anthony Foxx on April 25 and reported the United States and Europe were on the same side. (Secretary Foxx's meeting with Bulc reported septel.)

3. (U) Party leaders' tones varied consistent with their bloc's established positions, but overall ENVI MEPs are eager to maintain and bolster EU leadership and ambition for greenhouse gas emissions reduction efforts in general. ENVI MEPs are conscious that they enjoy particular influence on aviation emissions because "Stop the Clock"—which suspended the application of the EU Emissions Trading Scheme (ETS) to international flights to and from Europe—expires at the end of 2016 with or without a global agreement. The MEPs widely agreed that EP support for the ICAO GMBM—and permanent non-application of ETS to international flights—will be contingent on proposals from the Commission to supplement action under ICAO with unilateral or bilateral (with the United States) additional ambition.



4. (U) Bulc insisted that the question of whether to continue including intra-Europe aviation in the ETS must wait until after ICAO concludes the GMBM negotiations. She did not directly address rumors that the U.S. EPA plans to set stronger standards for U.S. carriers, on either fuel economy or offset purchases or the MEPs' calls for a bilateral agreement with the United States. In response to MEPs' concerns that exemptions would potentially defang the GMBM, Bulc downplayed their scale, noting exemptions would be limited to the poorest, most-isolated, and generally least-connected countries where the system would be cost-prohibitive to implement.

5. (SBU) Comment: MEPs, especially those in ENVI, view themselves as torchbearers on this issue, and ones holding leverage in Stop the Clock. However, they do not appear eager to engage in another drawn-out fight over applying ETS to international flights. Even the MEPs most critical of the ICAO proposal and most ardently advocating for ambitious action on aviation emissions did not reject the proposal; they sought to protect the EU's ability to enforce additional ambition via ETS, and called for additional actions unilaterally or bilaterally, leaving room for the Commission to pledge supplemental efforts without disrupting the ICAO process.

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

**Signature:**

Gardner

---

**Drafted By:**

**Cleared By:**

BRUSSELS:Robinson, Mark T (USEU)

USEU/ECON:Oosterloo, Hylko J (USEU)

USEU/FAA:Malo, Gjergj (Dept of Transportation)

USEU/ECON:Roth, Amy E (USEU)

USEU/EXEC:McHone, Christopher H (USEU)

**Approved By:**

**Released By:**

**Info:**

USEU/ECON:Koplovsky, Michael (USEU)

BRUSSELS:Robinson, Mark T (USEU)

EU MEMBER STATES COLLECTIVE *ROUTINE*

---

**Dissemination Rule:**

Released Copy

**UNCLASSIFIED**

SBU

